

Staff Report



Development Services Department

www.kitchener.ca

REPORT TO: Heritage Kitchener

DATE OF MEETING: August 6, 2024

SUBMITTED BY: Garett Stevenson, Director of Development and Housing Approvals, 519-741-2200 ext. 7070

PREPARED BY: Michelle Drake, Senior Heritage Planner, 519-741-2200 ext. 7839

WARD(S) INVOLVED: Ward 9

DATE OF REPORT: July 4, 2024

REPORT NO.: DSD-2024-340

SUBJECT: Notice of Intention to Designate 148 Madison Avenue South under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act

RECOMMENDATION:

That pursuant to Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act, the Clerk be directed to publish a Notice of Intention to Designate the property municipally addressed as 148 Madison Avenue South as being of cultural heritage value or interest.

REPORT HIGHLIGHTS:

- The purpose of this report is to request that Council publish a Notice of Intention to Designate 148 Madison Avenue South Under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- An updated Statement of Significance describing the cultural heritage value or interest of 148 Madison Avenue South has been drafted by Heritage Planning staff.
- The key finding of this report is that 148 Madison Avenue South meets eight (8) of nine (9) criteria for designation under *Ontario Heritage Act Regulation 9/06* (amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*) and has been confirmed to be a significant cultural heritage resource recognized for its design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual values.
- There are no financial implications.
- Community engagement included informing residents by posting this report with the agenda in advance of the Heritage Kitchener Committee meeting, providing written correspondence to the property owner, and consulting with Heritage Kitchener at their August 6, 2024 committee meeting. Should Council choose to give Notice of Intention to Designate, such notice shall be served to the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust.
- This report supports the delivery of core services.

BACKGROUND:

148 Madison Avenue South is a mid-20th century brick church built in the Romanesque architectural style. The church is situated on a 0.68 acre parcel of land located on the north

*** This information is available in accessible formats upon request. ***
Please call 519-741-2345 or TTY 1-866-969-9994 for assistance.

west corner of Courtland Avenue East and Madison Avenue South in the Mill Courtland Woodside Park Planning Community of the City of Kitchener within the Region of Waterloo. The principal resource that contributes to the heritage value is the church.



Figure 1.0: Location Map of Subject Property (148 Madison Avenue South)

A full assessment of 148 Madison Avenue South has been completed, including: field evaluation and archival research. The findings concluded that the subject property meets eight (8) of nine (9) criteria for designation under *Ontario Heritage Act Regulation 9/06* (amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*). An updated Statement of Significance describing the property's cultural heritage value or interest was presented to the Heritage Kitchener Committee on May 7, 2024. The Committee recommended that pursuant to Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the cultural heritage value or interest of 148 Madison Avenue South should be confirmed by pursuing designation of the subject property under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This work was undertaken as part of the City's Municipal Heritage Register (MHR) Review, initiated in February of 2023. The MHR Review is the City's response to amendments to the *Ontario Heritage Act* introduced in January of 2023 through Bill 23, the *More Homes Built Faster Act*. Bill 200, the *Homeowner Protect Act, 2024*, extended the time municipalities have to designate properties listed on their municipal heritage registers until January 1, 2027. The City contacted owners of listed properties through an initial letter dated May 23, 2023, to inform them of this undertaking. Owners of properties recommended for designation were contacted via a second letter. The property owner for 148 Madison Avenue South was contacted via second letter sent by mail dated May 17, 2024. This letter was accompanied by the updated Statement of Significance and a "Guide to Heritage Designation for Property Owners" prepared in June 2023. The letter invited property owners to contact the City's Senior Heritage Planner with any comments, questions, or concerns.

Per standard procedure, should Council support the Notice of Intention to Designate (NOID), the property owner will be contacted a third time through a letter advising of the City's NOID. An ad for the NOID will be published in a newspaper. Once the letter is served on the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust, and the newspaper ad is posted, there will be a 30-day appeal period in which the property owner may object to the designation.



Figure 2.0: Front Elevation (South Façade)

REPORT:

Identifying and protecting cultural heritage resources within our City is an important part of planning for the future, and helping to guide change while conserving the buildings, structures, and landscapes that give the City of Kitchener its unique identity. The City plays a critical role in the conservation of cultural heritage resources. The designation of property under the *Ontario Heritage Act* is the main tool to provide long-term conservation of cultural heritage resources for future generations. Designation recognizes the importance of a property to the local community; protects the property's cultural heritage value or interest; encourages good stewardship and conservation; and, promotes knowledge and understanding about the property. Designation not only publicly recognizes and promotes awareness, but it also provides a process for ensuring that changes to a property are appropriately managed and that these changes respect the property's cultural heritage value or interest.

148 Madison Avenue South is recognized for its design/physical, historical/associative, and contextual values. It satisfies eight (8) of nine (9) criteria for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act Regulation 9/06* (amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*). A summary of the criteria that is or is not met is provided in the table below.

Criteria	Criteria Met (Yes/No)
1. The property has design value or physical value because it is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, material, or construction method.	Yes
2. The property has design value or physical value because it displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.	Yes
3. The property has design or physical value because it demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.	Unknown
4. The property has historical value or associative value because it has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community.	Yes
5. The property has historical or associative value because it yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture.	Yes
6. The property has historical value or associative value because it demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.	Yes
7. The property has contextual value because it is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area.	Yes
8. The property has contextual value because it is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings.	Yes
9. The property has contextual value because it is a landmark.	Yes

Table 1: Criteria for Designation under *Ontario Regulation 9/06* (Amended by *Ontario Regulation 569/22*)

Design/Physical Value

The property demonstrates design/physical value as a rare and unique example of a mid-20th century church built in the Romanesque architectural style. The building has many intact heritage attributes in good condition.

Front (South) Façade

The front façade of the building faces Madison Avenue South and is comprised of three irregular bays.

The centre bay projects forward and features: a front-facing ridged gable roofline; rose window; ribbon of three window openings with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base; the windows are surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; the upper half of the façade is stone while the lower half is semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; there are two one-storey buttresses at each end of the centre bay primarily constructed

with buff (yellow) brick with stone at top; decorative stone crosses are inset within the semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; the main entrance features primarily plain archivolts with one decorative floral arch resting on round embedded stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base; a pair of stained glass windows with semi-circular arches flank each side of the main entrance and are surrounded stone; and, a wide concrete/stone staircase with metal railings leads to the main entrance.

The left (west) bay is setback from the centre bay and features: an octagon plan with only six visible sides; a flat roof with copper trim; semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; one flat head stained glass window with a stone lintel, quoins and sill; a pair of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; and, a rusticated stone foundation.

The right (east) bay is setback from the centre bay and features: square plan; flat roof; prominent square bell tower (decorative floral stone motifs; cornice with small stone dentils; a pair of semi-circular arches that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone; heavy cornice beneath the bell with larger stone dentils); stone and semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; semi-circular stained glass window and window opening with stone surround; flathead stained glass window and window opening with stone surround; a pair of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; and, a rusticated stone foundation.

Side (West) Façade

The side façade faces the former St. Joseph's Catholic School. Only a partial view of the side façade is visible from the public realm. The most prominent feature is the protruding octagon with only six visible sides, which features a flat roof with copper trim; semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; flat head stained glass windows with a stone lintels, quoins and sills; pairs of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; and, a rusticated stone foundation. Other visible heritage attributes include: the flat roof with copper trim; semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; flat head stained glass windows with a stone lintels, quoins and sills; large semi-circular stained glass windows and window openings with stone surrounds; and, a rusticated stone foundation.

Side (East) Façades

The side façade faces Madison Avenue South and is comprised of several irregular bays.

The left (south) bay features: square plan; flat roof with copper trim; prominent square bell tower (decorative floral stone motifs; cornice with small stone dentils; a pair of semi-circular arches that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone; heavy cornice beneath the bell with larger stone dentils); stone and semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; flathead stained glass window and window opening with stone surround; semi-circular stained glass window and window opening with stone surround; side entrance with plain archivolts resting on round embedded stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base; and, a rusticated stone foundation.

The central bay is inset and features: gable roof with copper trim; semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; semi-circular stained-glass windows and window openings with stone surround; flat head 1/1 basement windows and window openings with stone lintels and sills; and, rusticated stone foundation.

The right (north) bay features: prominent gable with copper trim; a plain vertical stone rectangle with stone surround (perhaps once a cast stone gable vent); a pair of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; flat head 1/1 basement windows and window openings with stone lintels and sills; and, rusticated stone foundation. To the right of the gable is a one-storey section that features: flat roof with copper trim; flat head stained-glass windows and window openings with stone surround; entrance door with rectangular stone surround; and, rusticated stone foundation.

The Parish House also faces Madison Avenue South and features: hip roof with a cross on the front; brick construction; symmetrical façade with a central main entrance door and window above flanked by a single window and a pair of windows on both the first and second storey; front door and door opening with side lites; flat head 1/1 windows and window openings with stone sills; and, concrete foundation.

Rear (South) Façade

The rear (north) façade faces the Parish House and only a portion of this façade is visible from the public realm. The prominent feature on this façade is the semi-circular plan with round copper dome. Other heritage attributes include: semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick; flat head stained-glass windows and window openings with stone sills; flat head basement windows with stone lintels; and, rusticated stone foundation.

Historical/Associative Value

The historical and associative values relate to the original owner, congregation, original pastor, architect and builder. The St. Joseph website (<https://stjosephkitchener.org/history>) contains a detailed Parish Timeline, history of Priests of St Joseph, 50th Anniversary Booklet (1980), 60 Years Working Together (1990), 75 Year Directory – Our History (2005), and 85 Year Directory – Our History (2015). Most of the following information was obtained from the St. Joseph website.

The lands were secured from the school board in 1930 for \$3000. The congregation was formed in 1930 when Monsignor Reuben M. Haller was assigned the task of building a church due to the growing congregation at St. Mary's and Sacred Heart. The first mass was held on October 26, 1930 in the St. Joseph's School hall. Monsignor R.M. Haller was the first diocesan priest to serve Kitchener; the first priest of the City to be made a Monsignor while serving the community; and, the first living person to have a new separate school named in his honour. Construction of the basement began in the fall of 1930 with church services being held in the basement by Christmas. Due to a steel shortage during the depression the remainder of the church was not built until 1952. The church was dedicated on April 12, 1953 by Bishop J.F. Ryan of Hamilton and the cornerstone was laid on July 20, 1952 by Monsignor A. J. O'Brien of Hamilton assisted by Rev. R.M. Haller and Rev. H.B. Smith. According to an article in the KW Record (April 11, 1953) the church was "built to match the design of the Pope's private chapel in Rome."

The rectory was built on Madison Avenue South in 1958, a plaque in memory of Monsignor Haller was unveiled in 1980, the sanctuary was renovated in 1986, some brickwork was redone in 1988 and some of the brick on the tower was replaced with stone in 1996.

The church was designed by Bernal A. Jones. B.A. Jones attended the Toronto Technical School and worked as a draftsman for Frank Darling, in the office of Darling and Pearson, between 1908 and 1922. B.A. Jones moved to Kitchener in 1922 and worked with W.H.E. Schmalz until opening his own office in 1926. During that time B.A. Jones assisted W.H.E. Schmalz design the 1922-23 Kitchener City Hall. B.A. Jones is also responsible for the design of several other important buildings in Kitchener such as the 1932 Public Utilities Building and the 1936-37 Church of the Good Shepherd.

The church was constructed by Ball Brothers Ltd. Ball Brothers Ltd. were general contractors formed by the partnership of Harold and Frank Ball in 1923. Ball Brothers Ltd. was a local based company but known across the province. Local examples of their work include: large portions of St. Mary's Hospital and Grand River Hospital; Centre in the Square; various buildings at Conestoga College, Wilfrid Laurier University, the University of Waterloo and the University of Guelph; the former Budd automotive plant (demolished); and, the Kitchener railway barns (demolished). The company is now known as Ball Construction.

Heritage Attributes

The heritage value of 148 Madison Avenue South resides in the following heritage attributes:

- All elements related to the design/physical value of the church built in the Romanesque architectural style, including:
 - All elements of the front (south) façade, including:
 - three irregular bays;
 - the centre bay that projects forward and features:
 - a front-facing ridged gable roofline;
 - rose window;
 - ribbon of three window openings with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base;
 - windows surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill;
 - stone and semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - two one-storey buttresses at each end of the centre bay primarily constructed with buff (yellow) brick with stone at top;
 - decorative stone crosses are inset within the semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - main entrance features primarily plain archivolt with one decorative floral arch resting on round embedded stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base;

- pair of stained glass windows with semi-circular arches flanking each side of the main entrance and stone surround; and,
 - wide concrete/stone staircase with metal railings.
- the left (west) bay that is setback from the centre bay and features:
 - octagon plan with only six visible sides;
 - flat roof with copper trim;
 - semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - one flat head stained glass window with stone lintel, quoins and sill;
 - pair of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation.
- the right (east) bay is setback from the centre bay and features:
 - square plan;
 - flat roof;
 - prominent square bell tower (decorative floral stone motifs; cornice with small stone dentils; a pair of semi-circular arches that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone; heavy cornice beneath the bell with larger stone dentils);
 - stone and semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - semi-circular stained-glass window and window opening with stone surround;
 - flathead stained-glass window and window opening with stone surround;
 - pair of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation.
- All elements of the side (West) façade, including:
 - protruding octagon with only six visible sides, including:
 - copper trim;
 - semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - flat head stained-glass windows with stone lintels, quoins and sills;
 - pairs of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained-glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation.
 - other visible heritage attributes include:
 - the flat roof with copper trim;

- semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
- flat head stained glass-windows with stone lintels, quoins and sills;
- large semi-circular stained-glass windows and window openings with stone surrounds; and,
- rusticated stone foundation.
- All elements of the side (East) façade, including:
 - several irregular bays;
 - the left (south) bay features:
 - square plan;
 - flat roof with copper trim;
 - prominent square bell tower (decorative floral stone motifs; cornice with small stone dentils; a pair of semi-circular arches that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone; heavy cornice beneath the bell with larger stone dentils);
 - stone and semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - flathead stained-glass window and window opening with stone surround;
 - semi-circular stained-glass window and window opening with stone surround;
 - side entrance with plain archivolt resting on round embedded stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation.
 - The central bay is inset and features:
 - gable roof with copper trim;
 - semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - semi-circular stained-glass windows and window openings with stone surround;
 - flat head 1/1 basement windows and window openings with stone lintels and sills; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation.
 - The right (north) bay features:
 - prominent gable with copper trim;
 - plain vertical stone rectangle with stone surround (perhaps once a cast stone gable vent);
 - pair of windows with semi-circular arches containing stained-glass windows that are separated by round stone columns with Corinthian capitals and a simple base and surrounded by stone arches, quoining and a single sill;
 - flat head 1/1 basement windows and window openings with stone lintels and sills; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation;
 - to the right of the gable is a one-storey section that features:
 - flat roof with copper trim;

- flat head stained-glass windows and window openings with stone surrounds;
- entrance door with rectangular stone surround; and,
- rusticated stone foundation.
- the Parish House features:
 - hip roof with a cross on the front;
 - brick construction;
 - symmetrical façade with a central main entrance door and window above flanked by a single window and a pair of windows on both the first and second storey;
 - front door and door opening with side lites;
 - flat head 1/1 windows and window openings with stone sills; and,
 - concrete foundation.
- All elements of the rear (South) façade including:
 - semi-circular plan with round copper dome;
 - semi-rugged buff (yellow) brick;
 - flat head stained-glass windows and window openings with stone sills;
 - flat head basement windows with stone lintels; and,
 - rusticated stone foundation.

STRATEGIC PLAN ALIGNMENT:

This report supports the delivery of core services.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS:

Capital Budget – The recommendation has no impact on the Capital Budget.

Operating Budget – The recommendation has no impact on the Operating Budget.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT:

INFORM – This report has been posted to the City’s website with the agenda in advance of the Heritage Kitchener committee meeting.

CONSULT– Heritage Planning staff have consulted with the Heritage Kitchener committee regarding designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Property owners were invited to consult via two separate letters dated May 23, 2023 and May 17, 2024.

Section 29(2) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* requires Council to consult with the Municipal Heritage Committee (Heritage Kitchener) before giving *Notice of Intention to Designate* (NOID) a property. Heritage Kitchener will be consulted via circulation and consideration of this report (see INFORM above). Members of the community will be informed via circulation of this report to Heritage Kitchener and via formal consideration by Council. Should Council choose to proceed with a NOID, such notice will be served on the property owner, the Ontario Heritage Trust, and published in the local newspaper. Once notice has been served, the property owner has the right of appeal to the Ontario Land Tribunal (OLT). Should Council decide not to proceed with a NOID then the building will remain on the City’s Municipal Heritage Register (MHR) until January 1, 2027, after which it will be

removed in accordance with the legislative changes enacted by Bill 200. Once removed from the MHR, it cannot be re-listed on the MHR for five (5) years (i.e., January 1, 2032).

PREVIOUS REPORTS/AUTHORITIES:

- *Ontario Heritage Act, 2022*
- *Ontario Regulation 9/06 (Amended by Ontario Regulation 569/22)*
- Bill 23 – Municipal Heritage Register Review (DSD-2023-225)
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – August 2023 Update (DSD-2023-309)
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – January 2024 Update (DSD-2024-022)
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – February 2024 Update (DSD-2024-056)
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – March 2024 Update (DSD-2024-093)
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – April 2024 Update (DSD-2024-131)
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – May 2024 Update (DSD-2024-194)
- *Bill 200, Homeowners Protection Act, 2024*
- Municipal Heritage Register Review – June 2024 Update (DSD-2024-250)

APPROVED BY: Justin Readman, General Manager, Development Services Department

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A – Statement of Significance for 148 Madison Avenue South